

c/o The British Institute of NDT  
1 Spencer Parade, Northampton  
NN1 5AA, United Kingdom

Tel: +44(0)1604-259-056  
Fax: +44(0)1604-231-489  
E-mail: john.thompson@bindt.org



## CONFIRMED MINUTES OF THE 19<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE UK NATIONAL AEROSPACE NDT BOARD

Meeting Date: Wednesday 25<sup>th</sup> February 2009

Location: Bombardier, Belfast.

The meeting was opened at 09:00 by Mr. Jon Biddulph, the Chairman of the Board. Mr. Eric McIlroy welcomed those present on behalf of Bombardier.

1. Confirmation of the [agenda](#). The agenda was confirmed with the addition of item 10b.
2. Attendance & apologies for absence
  - a. The meeting was attended by Messrs. J Biddulph (Chairman, Rolls Royce), E McIlroy and B Scott (Bombardier), K Phillips and T Hiscox (Airbus UK), G McCully (Outside Agencies, Co-opted), I Chapman (CAA – Co-opted) and J Thompson (Secretary, BINDT, Co-opted).
  - b. Apologies were recorded for Messrs. P Berkeley (Agusta Westland), C Dootson (BAE Systems), A Lambie (Secretary, BINDT, Co-opted), R Hogarth (BA), S Gane (Honeywell), B Rossiter and B Murrell (Messier Dowty), and C Thomas (Messier Dowty and UK TEG).
  - c. The meeting was attended by the representatives of only three of the eight members' organisations, and thus was in-quorate. It was agreed that any decisions made in this meeting would be subject to confirmation by absent members' representatives within 21 days of circulation of the draft minutes. Failure to positively confirm agreement with decisions recorded herein (as indicated by a remark in **red text**) to be considered as an endorsement by the members representatives that had apologised for absence at this meeting.
3. [Notes of the last meeting](#)
  - a. The notes of the last meeting (distributed earlier) were **accepted as an accurate record**, and were authorised for upload to the Board's web pages as Confirmed Minutes.
  - b. The following actions were assigned at the 18th meeting.

Reference	Agreed action	Assignment	Remarks
2008/34	Upload Confirmed Minutes of the 17 <sup>th</sup> meeting of the UK NANDTB and unconfirmed minutes of the 18 <sup>th</sup> meeting of the UK NANDTB	BINDT CSD Administration	Secretary action completed 2008-11-25

Reference	Agreed action	Assignment	Remarks
2008/35	Circulate draft rev C of Limited L2 Policy document to members for review and comment and/or indication of support for approval.	Secretary & members	Secretary action completed 2008-11-24. Having received no adverse comments, the document was approved for publication as NANDTB17
2008/36	Review and propose additions and/or indicate support for approval of the method/technique training matrix.	Members	Secretary action completed 2008-11-24. Members' action carried forward. Additions or comments by 2009-01-31; revised and updated document to be tabled at the next meeting. If no input, draft to be shelved.
2008/37	Notify CMC Chairman and BINDT Council of recommendation of appointing R Hogarth to CMC with a view to ratification at the 11 <sup>th</sup> December 2008 meeting of BINDT Council.	Secretary	Secretary action completed 2008-11-21
2008/38	Notify all appropriate bodies and individuals of the appointment of Mr. Lambie to the post of Secretary, UK National Aerospace NDT Board.	Secretary	Secretary action completed 2008-11-24
2008/39	Make enquiries with Professor Peter Cawley of Imperial College, and to convene the first composites AHTG meeting at Aviation House, Gatwick Airport (South) on 22 <sup>nd</sup> January 2009 @ 09:00.	JRT	Initial action completed 2008-11-24. Issued agenda and papers by 2008-12-31; Secretariat action completed.
2008/40	(1) Review draft PCN examination papers provided at the meeting and to return papers, by secure means, marked up with comments, to Alexander Lambie, the new UK NANDTB Secretary. (2) Following receipt, the Secretary to incorporate necessary changes to papers or to remove and replace questions before issuing the papers for use and (3) Prepare aerospace specific examination papers across all methods for submission to the next meeting.	Messrs. Phillips, Hiscox, Berkley, Hogarth and Lambie	Action timescales: (1) By 2008-12-31. Completed. (2) By 2009-01-31. Ongoing. (3) By 2009-01-31. Ongoing: circulate papers by secure transmission to those identified at Annex B. Recipients to review and comment to Mr. Alex Lambie by 2009-03-31. AWL waiting for papers to be returned. New action on AWL.
2008/41	Circulate revised PCN Aero; Members to review and comment.	JRT and members	Secretary action completed 2008-11-24. Members: 2008-12-31. Completed.
2008/42	Show internal and outside agencies on separate lists within audit and accreditation schedules.	BINDT Compliance Manager	Drawn to PJM's attention 2008-11-24 by JRT. PJM action by 2008-12-31. Completed.
2008/43	Make appropriate proposal on frequency of assessment of OA, AQB and ATO through CMC (2009-02-12) and MQ&E (2009-02-11).	JRT	By 2009-01-31. Completed

Reference	Agreed action	Assignment	Remarks
2008/44	Communicate to Outside Agencies and the UK TEG the opportunity to propose an acceptable alternative to NANDTB/16.	GMcC and CT	Completed 2008-11-24 by JRT. <b>Action on UK TEG members is ongoing.</b>
2008/45	Draft communiqué to CAA Surveyors, and pass draft for comment.	IC; JB and JRT	By 2008-12-31. Action carried forward with <b>urgent response requested by 2000-03-31.Ongoing</b>
2008/46	Communicate in writing the support of the CAA in taking a leading role in the work of the European Forum of NANDTB.	IC/TB	Completed.

- c. Concerning Action 2008/45: IC reported that airworthiness surveyors' updating training sessions have included a briefing on the need to ascertain whether, if in-house training and qualification of NDFT personnel is utilised, that provision has been assessed and accredited by BINDT under NANDTB/12 arrangements. IC indicated the importance of having published agreed policy in this area, but that this should be buttressed by a persuasive 'best practice' approach and recommendations to part 145 organisations in order to 'encourage' them to make application for accreditation.

#### 4. Membership

- a. The [current membership list](#) was reviewed.
- b. It was noted that the terms of office of the Chairman and Vice Chairman had expired in September 2008. Mr. Biddulph indicated a willingness to continue as chairman with the support of the Board Members and, on a proposal from EM, seconded by TH, his re-appointment backdated to September 2008 was agreed (**subject to confirmation by at least two other members from those that had tendered apologies for absence**) Confirmed at 20<sup>th</sup> Meeting 2009-05-12.
- c. On a proposal from EM, seconded by TH, Mr. Keith Phillips was appointed Vice Chairman, effective from the date of the current meeting (**subject to confirmation by at least two other members from those that had tendered apologies for absence**). **Action 2009/01: All absent members' representatives** Confirmed at 20<sup>th</sup> Meeting 2009-05-12
- d. The meeting decided, in the present economic climate, to reallocate the venue for the 22<sup>nd</sup> (11<sup>th</sup> November) meeting from Glasgow to Filton (Airbus UK).

#### 5. NANDTB documents due review within next 6 month period ([NANDTB/01](#))

- a. The initial review of NANDTB/12 was allocated to T Hiscox and A Lambie.
  - i. NANDTB/12 reviewers were directed to take account of the fact that this document determines the methodology of how the Board controls qualification examinations, and that this has a direct effect upon the applicable Generic Requirements (GR23). Reviewers are requested to consult with the Chairman, and with the CAA, if considered necessary.
  - ii. It was proposed and agreed that the subject of corrective and preventive actions, following root cause analysis of failure, would be included in the revision of NANDTB/12, and that adoption of the text and philosophy in ISO 9001:2008 should be considered by the reviewers.
- b. The initial review of NANDTB/15 was allocated to G McCully and C Thomas
- c. Review comments and proposals for amendment to be with the Secretary (AWL) by 12<sup>th</sup> April 2009, and a draft revision for approval to be submitted to the 20<sup>th</sup> meeting (circulated by 23<sup>rd</sup> April 2009).

#### 6. Documents for discussion/approval

- a. The [comments](#) submitted in respect of [PCN/Aero](#) were reviewed and, where appropriate, amendments agreed. **PCN/Aero and its appendices were approved for publication on 1<sup>st</sup> April 2009** with a view to implementation after three months in the public domain (1<sup>st</sup> July 2009). **Action 2009/02: Secretariat** to publish and implement PCN/Aero and appendices following approval by the CMC.
7. Review and approval of PCN examination papers in accordance with [NANDTB/13](#) and [NANDTB/13B](#) procedure.
    - a. General papers had been tabled at the last meeting. Comments had been received from most of the reviewers (KP handed to JRT for transmission to AWL the marked-up copy of E-ABA3-No1, Issue 1 dated 19<sup>th</sup> November 2008)
    - b. Level 2 and Level 3 PCN [Specific](#) examination papers were allocated for review by members as detailed in Annex B. These papers are to be transmitted by secure means to the individuals named, with comments and suggestions for amendment to be remitted to AWL by 2009-03-31.
  8. Control of Qualifying Agencies
    - a. The audit reports of PCN AQB's were presented and noted.
    - b. The audit reports of outside and internal qualifying agencies were reviewed (in the absence of GMcC, who declared an interest and absented himself from this section of the meeting) and noted.
    - c. It was agreed that the Secretary would liaise with the Chairman to agree which of the AQB and OA assessments during 2009 would be subject to overview by members of the Board. **Action 2009/03: AWL**
    - d. It was agreed that all qualifying agencies should be reminded of the deadline for implementation of prEN 4179:2008 / AIA-NAS-410:2008 in all written practices where the qualification examinations were under the effective control of the UK NANDTB. **Action 2009/04: AWL and GMcC.**
  9. Outside Agency Questions and Interpretations
    - a. GMcC had invited questions and interpretation requests, but none had been remitted for this meeting.
  10. Standards (prEN 4179:2008 and AIA-NAS-410 3<sup>rd</sup> Ed.)
    - a. An in-depth discussion of the meaning of "open book" in the context of prEN 4179:2008 specific examinations followed. The standard was clear that the examination "shall" be 'open book', and shall "*cover the specifications, codes, equipment, operating procedures and test techniques the candidate may use in the performance of his/her duties with the employer*". However, confusingly, it went on to state that "*Reference material such as specifications, tables, formulas, etc. may be provided as determined by the Responsible Level 3 or Examiner*". This was not made clearer in the definition of 'open book', which states that it is "An examination administered with access to specific reference material that is provided with or referenced in the examination". JRT suggested that he could comply with the requirement without allowing access to reference material during the examination. JB accepted and action to draft an advisory notice on the matter of 'open book' examinations, and also to define the process for submission of and dealing with requests for interpretation. **Action 2009/05: JB** (JRT to assist with provision of ASME code case procedure)
    - b. The meeting reviewed and discussed the intent of prEN 4179:2008 and [NAS-410:2008](#) clause 4.5 with respect to:
      - i. roles and tasks of the RL3
      - ii. Selection of techniques within method
      - iii. 4179 v PCN

After detailed discussion, it was concluded that there was no lack of clarity, or conflict between standards and normative documents

11. ANDTBF matters (overall strategy, [action plan](#) & topics for [2009-06-23 agenda](#))
    - a. There was an extended discussion of the failure on the part of EASA to attend meetings of the ANDTBF. It was noted that an EASA representative had been in attendance at only one (the 2<sup>nd</sup>) of the first five meetings. The Board considered that this was an unsatisfactory situation, and that pressure should be maintained upon EASA by the ANDTBF to attend meetings of the Forum, suggesting that attending just one meeting per annum was not sufficient. The main purpose of the Forum was to harmonise NANDTB operations in member states, and it was considered essential for the regulatory agency to be present when a harmonised policy was being discussed for adoption.
    - b. The majority of the Members of the Forum had agreed the need for revision of parts 21 and 145, and the EASA position of *not* revising regulations except in the case of a safety concern was untenable; In the UK context, the interaction between the Board and the NRA was a very positive thing, and it was felt that a similar positive interaction was essential at the European level (Forum and Agency).
    - c. It was agreed that the Chairman and Secretary of the Forum would redraft the ANDTBF strategic plan, re-emphasising the importance of the previously agreed objectives to involve EASA, and revise regulations parts 21 and 145 with a view to integration. **Action 2009/06: JB/JRT** (2009-05-12 to the UK NANDTB and 2009-06-23 to the ANDTBF)
  12. A PowerPoint [Report](#) from the Chairman of the NDT of composites Ad Hoc group (Colin Thomas) was presented by the Secretary. The Board noted that progress being made, and anticipated a draft for discussion prior to the next meeting (May 2009).
  13. There being no other business, the Chairman thanked the Bombardier representatives (Messrs. McIlroy and Scott) for the excellent facilities and refreshments provided.
  14. The date(s) and location(s) of the 20<sup>th</sup> 21<sup>st</sup> and 22<sup>nd</sup> meetings respectively of the UK NAndtB were noted as being:
    - a. 12<sup>th</sup> May 2009, BAE Warton
    - b. 11<sup>th</sup> August, MT&D, Cardiff
    - c. 11<sup>th</sup> November, Airbus, Filton (note change of location)
-

## ANNEX A: ACTIONS ALLOCATED AT THE 19<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE UK NANADTB

Ref	Agreed action	Assignment	Remarks
2008/36	Review and propose additions and/or indicate support for approval of the method/technique training matrix.	Members	Secretary action completed 2008-11-24. Members' action carried forward. Additions or comments by 2009-01-31; <b>revised and updated document to be tabled at the next meeting. If no input, draft to be shelved.</b> New action AL 2009/
2008/40	(2) Following receipt, the Secretary to incorporate necessary changes to papers or to remove and replace questions before issuing the papers for use (3) Distribute aerospace specific examination papers across all methods, as indicated in Annex B.	See Annex B	(2) By 2009-01-31. <b>Ongoing.</b>  (3) <b>Recipients to review and comment to Mr. Alex Lambie by 2009-03-31. AL awaiting return of all Level 2 papers before circulating Level 3 papers, ongoing.</b>
2008/44	Communicate to Outside Agencies and the UK TEG the opportunity to propose an acceptable alternative to NANDTB/16.	GMcC and CT	Completed 2008-11-24 by JRT. <b>Action on UK TEG members is ongoing.</b>
2008/45	Draft communiqué on BINDT accreditation of training and examinations administered by internal qualifying agencies to CAA Surveyors, and pass draft for comment to JB and AWL.	IC; JB and AWL	By 2008-12-31. Action carried forward with <b>urgent response requested by 2000-03-31.</b> New action on CL
2009/01	Confirm the appointment of Messrs. Biddulph and Phillips, respectively, to the positions of chairman and vice chairman.	Those representatives absent at the present meeting	2009-03-31 Confirmed at 20 <sup>th</sup> meeting 2009-05-12
2009/02	Publish and implement PCN/Aero and appendices following approval by the CMC.	AWL	2009-04-01 and 2009-07-01 Completed
2009/03	Liaise with the Chairman to agree which of the AQB and OA assessments during 2009 would be subject to overview by members of the Board	AWL	2009-03-31 TH SWS School Cardiff OA ongoing
2009/04	Qualifying agencies to be reminded of the deadline for implementation of prEN 4179:2008 / AIA-NAS-410:2008 in all written practices where the qualification examinations were under the effective control of the UK NANDTB.	AWL/GMcC	2009-03-31 Completed
2009/05	Draft advisory notice on the matter of 'open book' examinations, and define the process for submission of and dealing with requests for interpretation (JRT to assist with provision of ASME code case procedure).	JB/JRT	2009-03-31 Completed
2009/06	redraft ANDTBF strategic plan, re-emphasising the importance of the previously agreed objectives to involve EASA in meetings and to continue to put pressure on EASA to revise regulations parts 21 and 145 with a view to integration	JB/JRT	2009-05-12 to the UK NANDTB 2009-06-23 to the ANDTBF

## ANNEX B: ALLOCATION OF PCN EXAMINATION PAPERS FOR REVIEW AND COMMENT

Hard copies of the question papers listed below are to be sent by secure means to those listed below for review, comment, amendment (if necessary) and approval:

PAPER REF	ASSIGNED TO	REMARKS
E-AAA3-NO2 ET3 1-08 JUN 06	K Phillips	
E-AAA3-NO1 ET3 1-08 JUN 06	R Hogarth	Returned with comments
E-AAA3-NO1 MT3 1-19 NOV 08	B Scott	Returned with comments
E-AAA2-NO3 ET2 1-01 AUG 08	K Phillips	
E-AAA2-NO5 ET2 1-01 AUG 08	T Hiscox	Returned with comments
E-ACA2-NO3 PT2 1-01 AUG 08	B Scott	Returned with comments
E-ACA2-NO4 PT2 1-01 AUG 08	T Hiscox	Returned with comments
E-ADA2-NO5 RT2 1-01 AUG 08	C Dootson	
E-ADA2-NO6 RT2 1-01 AUG 08	C Dootson	
E-AEA2-NO3 UT2 1-01 AUG 08	P Berkeley	
E-AEA2-NO4 UT2 1-01 AUG 08	P Berkeley	

There is a shortage of centrally issued Level 3 papers, if I can't establish a working group to address the shortage, a Level 3 will have to be engaged to complete the task. AWL 2009-02-09

Reference to examination papers in recent minutes:

**2008-08-14** 7. The present meeting had been intended to include a review for issue and implementation of PCN specific examination papers. However, due to problems encountered, it was agreed to defer this action to the next meeting.

**Action 2008/26.** The Secretary to provide new draft PCN specific examination papers for review and approval at the Thursday 20<sup>th</sup> November 2008 meeting.

**2008-11-20** 7b. PCN draft examination papers (deferred action from last meeting) and statistical data on questions were tabled, and four Board members accepted an action to review draft PCN examination papers and remit comments to Mr. Alexander Lambie.

**Action 2008/40: Messrs. Phillips, Hiscox, Berkley and Hogarth** to review draft PCN examination papers provided at the meeting and to return papers, by secure means, marked up with comments, to Alexander Lambie, the new UK NANDTB Secretary. Following receipt, **AWL** to incorporate necessary changes to papers or to remove and replace questions before issuing the papers for use and preparing Aerospace specific papers across all methods for submission to the next meeting.